

‘Āshūrā’ – History, virtues & rulings from the salaf

Muzammil al-Balūshī

Salafi Research Institute

© Copyright 2026 Salafi Research Institute

'Āshūrā' – History, virtues & rulings from the salaf

1st Edn. © [SRI] Salafi Research Institute

Muḥarram 1448H / June 2026

All rights reserved No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilized in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, No known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, without prior Permission from the publishers or authors.



LONDON - BIRMINGHAM - LAHORE

In Defence of the Sunni Creed and Manhaj

***Bismillāh al-Raḥmān al-Raḥīm wa bihī nasta'īn.
Alḥamdullilāhi Rabbil 'Alamīn, Waṣalatu Wassalām
'Ala Rasūlillahil Karīm, Wa 'Ala Alihī Wa Aṣḥābīhi Wa
Man Tabi'ahum Bi-Eḥsān Illa' Yaum al-Dīn Amma Ba'd***

*All Gratitude belongs to the Rabb of all beings.
May the Praise and Salutations be upon His
final Messenger, his revered family and
his noble Companions and upon
those who follow them in good
until the end of times,
To proceed,*

We have approached yet another season to gain rewards and remove our sins. He chooses some places and times with virtues so we exert in acts of worship with the guidelines of His messenger as Allah says:

﴿وَرَبُّكَ يَخْلُقُ مَا يَشَاءُ وَيَخْتَارُ﴾ [القصص: ٦٨]

"And your Rabb creates what He wills and chooses" [28:68]

Muḥarram is one of the four sacred months:

﴿إِنَّ عِدَّةَ الشُّهُورِ عِنْدَ اللَّهِ اثْنَا عَشَرَ شَهْرًا فِي كِتَابِ اللَّهِ يَوْمَ خَلَقَ السَّمَوَاتِ وَالْأَرْضَ مِنْهَا أَرْبَعَةٌ حُرْمٌ﴾ [التوبة: ٣٦]

"Indeed, the number of months with Allāh is twelve in the register of Allāh (from) the day He created the heavens and the earth; of these, four are sacred" [9:36]

عن أبي بكر عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم أنه قال إن الزمان قد استدار كهيئته يوم خلق الله السماوات والأرض السنة اثنا عشر شهرا منها أربعة حرم ثلاثة متواليات ذو القعدة وذو الحجة والمحرم ورجب شهر مضر الذي بين جمادى وشعبان [البخاري (٤٦٦٢) ومسلم (١٦٧٩)]

Abū Bakrah (may Allah be pleased with him) narrated that the Prophet ﷺ said: "Indeed, time has revolved back to its state on the day Allāh created the heavens and the earth. The year is twelve months, of which four are sacred. Three are consecutive: Dhū al-Qa‘dah, Dhū al-Ḥijjah, and al-Muḥarram; and Rajab of Muḍar, which is between Jumādā and Sha‘bān." [Al-Bukhārī (4662) and Muslim (1679)]

al-Suddī, may Allah have mercy on him, explained:

أَمَّا {أَرْبَعَةٌ حُرْمٌ} فذو القعدة وذو الحجة والمحرم ورجب وأما {كِتَابِ اللَّهِ} فالذى عنده [تفسير الطبري (٤٤٢/١١) وسنده حسن]

"As for {four are sacred}, they are Dhū al-Qa‘dah, Dhū al-Ḥijjah, al-Muḥarram, and Rajab. And as for {the register of Allāh}, it is that which is with Him (the Preserved Tablet)." [Tafsīr al-Ṭabarī (11/442); Isnād Ḥasan]

The emphasised act of worship in this month is fasting as Abū Hurairah, may Allah be pleased with him said:

قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم أفضل الصيام بعد رمضان شهر الله المحرم [مسلم (١١٦٣)]

Allah’s Messenger ﷺ said: "the best fasting after Ramaḍān is in the month of Allah, Muḥarram" [Muslim 1163]

Al-Baghawī, may Allah have mercy on him, commented:

نسبه إلى نفسه على جهة التعظيم مع أن الشهور كلها لله [شرح السنة (٦/٣٤١)]

"He attributed it to Himself as magnification even though all the months are of Allah." [Sharḥ al-Sunnah 6/341]

The Jews used to fast this month:

عن ابن عباس رضي الله عنهما أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم قدم المدينة فوجد اليهود صياما يوم عاشوراء، فقال لهم رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم: ما هذا اليوم الذي تصومونه، فقالوا: هذا يوم عظيم، أنجى الله فيه موسى وقومه، وغرق فرعون وقومه، فصامه موسى شكرا، فنحن نصومه فقال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم: فنحن أحق وأولى بموسى منكم، فصامه رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وأمر بصيامه [مسلم (١١٣٠)]

Ibn ‘Abbās, may Allāh be pleased with both, said that Allāh’s Messenger ﷺ arrived Madīnah and found the Jews fasting on the day of ‘Āshūrā’. So the Messenger of Allāh ﷺ said to them: "What is this day that you are fasting?" They said: "This is a great day, in which Allāh saved Mūsā and his people, and drowned Fir‘awn and his people. So Mūsā fasted it out of gratitude, and so fast it." Thereupon Allah’s Messenger ﷺ said: "We have more right and are closer to Mūsā than you." So the Messenger of Allāh ﷺ fasted it and commanded its fasting. [Muslim (1130)]

كان يوم عاشوراء تعده اليهود عيداً، قال النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم: فصوموه أتمم [البخاري (٢٠٠٥) ومسلم (١١٣١)]

The day of ‘Āshūrā’ was regarded by the Jews as an ‘Īd, so the Prophet ﷺ said: "So fast it, all of you." [Al-Bukhārī (2005) and Muslim (1131)]

This was indeed a great victory from Allah, He said:

﴿وَأَنْجَيْنَا مُوسَىٰ وَمَنْ مَعَهُ وَأَجْمَعِينَ ﴿٦٥﴾ ثُمَّ أَغْرَقْنَا الْأَٰخَرِينَ ﴿٦٦﴾ إِنَّ فِي ذَٰلِكَ لَآيَةً لِّمَنْ كَانَ أَكْثَرُهُمْ مُّؤْمِنِينَ ﴿٦٧﴾﴾ [الشعراء: ٦٥-٦٧]

“And We saved Musa and those with him altogether. Then We drowned the others. Indeed, in that is a sign, and most of them were not believers.” [26:65-67]

Allah said about Fir‘awn:

﴿إِنَّ فِرْعَوْنَ عَلَا فِي الْأَرْضِ وَجَعَلَ أَهْلَهَا شِيَعًا يَسْتَضِعُّ طَائِفَةً مِنْهُمْ يُدَّبِحُ أَبْنَاءَهُمْ وَيَسْتَحْيِي نِسَاءَهُمْ إِنَّهُ كَانَ مِنَ الْمُفْسِدِينَ﴾ [القصص: ٤]

“Indeed, Fir‘awn exalted himself in the land and made its people into groups, oppressing a group of them, slaughtering their sons, and keeping their women alive. Indeed, he was of the corrupters.” [28:4]

This was then passed onto the Arabs:

عن عائشة رضي الله عنها قالت كانت قریش تصوم عاشوراء في الجاهلية، وكان رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يصومه فلما هاجر إلى المدينة، صامه وأمر بصيامه، فلما فرض شهر رمضان، قال: من شاء صامه، ومن شاء تركه [البخاري (١٨٩٣) ومسلم (١١٢٥)]

‘Ā’ishah, may Allāh be pleased with her, said: "Quraysh used to fast [on the day of] ‘Āshūrā’ in the time of Jāhiliyyah, and Allah’s Messenger ﷺ also used to fast it. Then, when he migrated to Madīnah, he fasted it and commanded its fasting. But when the month of Ramaḍān was made obligatory, he said: 'Whoever wishes may fast it, and whoever wishes may leave it.'" [Al-Bukhārī (1893) and Muslim (1125)]

This means it was turned from an obligatory act into a recommended one as we learn from the narrations.

al-Shāfi'ī, may Allah have mercy on him, said:

لا يحتمل قول عائشة ترك عاشوراء معنى إلا ترك إيجاب صومه [اختلاف الحديث من كتاب الأم
[٦١٠ / ٨]

"The saying of 'Aishah does not entail leaving the fast of 'Āshūrā' except leaving the obligation of fasting it"
[Ikhtilāf al-ḥadīth from al-Umm 8/610]

Ibn Rajab said:

قيل: إنه زال التأكيد وبقي أصل الاستحباب، ولهذا قال قيس بن سعد: ونحن نفعله
[لطائف المعارف (ص ١٠٩)]

"It was said: Indeed, the emphasis has ceased but the basis of recommendation remains; and for this reason, Qays bin Sa'd said: "And we do it (fast it)." [Laṭā'if al-Ma'ārif (p. 109)]

This report is in Al-Nasā'ī (2506) with isnād ṣaḥīḥ.

Virtue:

وسئل عن صوم يوم عرفة، فقال: يكفر السنة الماضية والباقية، قال: وسئل عن صوم يوم عاشوراء،
فقال: يكفر السنة الماضية [مسلم (١١٦٢)]

And he (ﷺ) was asked about fasting the day of 'Arafah, so he said: 'it expiates the previous and next year's (sins).' And he was asked about fasting the day of 'Āshūrā', so he said: 'it expiates the previous year'" [Muslim 1162]

Evidences that it is recommended:

It is reported **Ibn Mas'ud** (Tahdhib al-Athar – Musnad 'Umar 659 & al-Sunan al-Kubra by al-Nasai 2860; Both Jayyid isnad), **'Ali, Abu Musa** (Tayalisi 1308, Tahdhib al-Athar – Musnad 'Umar (654); Sahih Isnad). May Allah be pleased with them. **al-Qasim bin Muhammad** (Muṣannaf Ibn Abi Shaybah 9615; Sahih Isnad), **al-Zuhri** (Tahdhib al-Athar – Musnad 'Umar 668; Isnad Hasan) would fast 'Āshūrā'. May Allah have mercy on them.

On the other hand, **Ibn 'Umar** (al-Bukhari 1892) would not fast it. And another narration (Muslim 1127) states that **Ibn Mas'ud** would at times not fast it. There is no issue in any of this as it is not obligatory but remains a sunnah of our Prophet ﷺ.

عن حميد بن عبد الرحمن أنه سمع معاوية بن أبي سفيان خطيباً بالمدينة يعني في مقدمة قدمها خطبهم يوم عاشوراء، فقال: أين علماءكم يا أهل المدينة؟ سمعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يقول: لهذا اليوم هذا يوم عاشوراء، ولم يكتب الله عليكم صيامه، وأنا صائم فمن أحب منكم أن يصوم، فليصم ومن أحب أن يفطر فليفطر [مسلم (١١٢٩)]

Ḥumayd bin 'Abd al-Raḥmān heard Mu'āwiyah bin Abī Sufyān delivering a sermon in al-Madīnah, meaning, during a visit he made, addressing them on the day of 'Āshūrā', saying: "Where are your scholars, O people of Madīnah? I heard Allāh's Messenger ﷺ saying regarding this day: 'This is the day of 'Āshūrā', and Allāh has not prescribed its fasting upon you, yet I am fasting. So

whoever among you wishes to fast, let him fast, and whoever wishes to break [his fast], let him break [it]."
[Muslim (1129)]

This is something upon which no scholar disagrees. Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, may Allah have mercy on him, said:

[يختلف العلماء أن يوم عاشوراء ليس بفرض صيامه] [الاستذكار 3/327]

"The scholars do not differ that the fasting of the day of 'Āshūrā' is not obligatory" [al-Istidhkār 3/327]

It is recommended for children before puberty as well:

ونصوم صبياننا الصغار منهم إن شاء الله، ونذهب إلى المسجد فنجعل لهم اللعبة من العهن، فإذا بكى أحدهم على الطعام أعطيناها إياه عند الإفطار [مسلم (1136)]

"And we would make our young children among them fast, if Allāh willed, and we would go to the masjid and make a toy for them from wool. Then, if one of them cried for food, we would give it to him until [the time of] breaking the fast." [Muslim (1136)]

This has immense effect on the upbringing of the children.

Permissibility of starting a voluntary fast after Fajr if one has not done things which break the fast

عن عبد الرحمن بن عوف أنه أضحى يوم عاشوراء حتى ارتفع النهار ولا يعلم، ثم علم بعد، ففزع لذلك، ثم صام، وأمرنا بالصيام بعد أن أضحى [تهديب الآثار - مسند عمر (٦٥٧) وسنده صحيح]

'Abdur-Raḥmān bin 'Awf (may Allah be pleased with him) entered the forenoon on the day of 'Āshūrā' until the day

had risen, while he did not know (it was ‘Āshūrā’). Then he came to know afterward, so he was alarmed by that; then he fasted, and he commanded us to fast after he had entered the forenoon. [Tahdhīb al-Āthār - Musnad ‘Umar (657); Isnād Ṣaḥīḥ]

Recommendation of fasting a day before it

عبد الله بن عباس رضي الله عنهما يقول حين صام رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يوم عاشوراء، وأمر بصيامه قالوا: يا رسول الله إنه يوم تعظمه اليهود والنصارى فقال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم: فإذا كان العام المقبل إن شاء الله صمنا اليوم التاسع، قال: فلم يأت العام المقبل حتى توفي رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم [مسلم (١١٣٤)]

‘Abdullāh bin ‘Abbās, may Allah be pleased with both, said: "When Allah’s Messenger ﷺ fasted the day of ‘Āshūrā’ and commanded its fasting, they said: 'O Allāh’s Messenger! Indeed, it is a day venerated by the Jews and Christians.' So Allāh’s Messenger ﷺ said: 'When the next year comes, if Allāh wills, we shall fast the ninth.' He (Ibn ‘Abbās) said: 'But the next year did not come before Allah’s Messenger ﷺ passed away.'" [Muslim (1134)]

قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم: إن عشت إن شاء الله إلى قابل صمت التاسع مخافة أن يفوتني يوم عاشوراء [الطبراني (١٠٨١٧) وسنده حسن]

Allah’s Messenger ﷺ said: "If I live until next year, if Allāh wills, I will fast the ninth, out of fear of missing the day of ‘Āshūrā’." [Al-Ṭabarānī (10817); Isnād Ḥasan]

ابن عباس يقول في يوم عاشوراء: خالفوا اليهود، وصوموا التاسع والعاشر. [مصنف عبد الرزاق (٨٠٨٦) وشرح معاني الآثار (٣٠٨٥) والسنن الكبير (٨٤٧٨) وشعب الإيمان (٣٥٠٩) وفضائل الأوقات (٢٤٢) بأسانيد جياد]

Ibn 'Abbās (may Allah be pleased with both) said about 'Āshūrā': "Differ from the Jews and fast the ninth and the tenth." [Muṣannaf 'Abd al-Razzāq (8086), Sharḥ Ma'ānī al-Āthār (3085), al-Sunan al-Kabīr (8478), Shu'ab al-Īmān (3509), and Faḍā'il al-Awqāt (242); Jayyid asānīd]

عن ابن سيرين: أنه كان يصوم العاشر اليوم العاشر، فأكثرُوا فقالوا: إن ابن عباس قال هو التاسع، فكان يصوم التاسع والعاشر [تهديب الآثار – مسند عمر (٦٦٩) وسنده صحيح]

Ibn Sīrīn (may Allah have mercy on him) said that he used to fast 'Āshūrā' on the tenth day, so they spoke much about it and said: 'Indeed, Ibn 'Abbās said it is the ninth.' So he began to fast the ninth and the tenth." [Tahdhīb al-Āthār - Musnad 'Umar (669); Isnād Ṣaḥīḥ]

قال إسحاق بن منصور: قلت: عاشوراء يوم التاسع أو العاشر؟ قال: يصوم يوم التاسع والعاشر. قال إسحاق: كما قال، لمخالفة اليهود؛ فإنهم يصومون يوماً واحداً. [مسال الكوسج (٦٨٨)]

Ishāq bin Maṣṣūr said: "I said (to Aḥmad bin Hanbal): 'Is 'Āshūrā' the ninth or the tenth day?' He said: 'One should fast the ninth and the tenth.' Ishāq said: ' (it is) as he said, to differ from the Jews; for they fast only one day.'" [Masā'il al-Kawsaj (688)]

These narrations also show that ‘Āshūrā’ is actually the tenth day but adding a day before it is recommended to differ from the Jews and to guarantee catching this great virtue. Likewise is adding a day after it and it anyways comes under fasting Muḥarram.

عن ابن عباس أنه كان يصوم قبله يوماً وبعده يوماً [تَهْدِيبُ الْأَثَارِ مُسْنَدُ عُمَرَ (٦٦٠) وَسَنَدُهُ صَحِيحٌ]

Ibn ‘Abbās (may Allah be pleased with both) used to fast a day before it and a day after it. [Tahdhīb al-Āthār - Musnad ‘Umar (660); Isnād Ṣaḥīḥ]

عن طاوس أنه كان يصوم قبله وبعده يوماً مخافة أن يفوته [ابن أبي شيبة (٩٦٣٠) وسنده صحيح]

Ṭāwūs used to fast a day before it and a day after it, for fear that it would pass him by. [Muṣannaf Ibn Abī Shaybah (9630); Isnād Ṣaḥīḥ]

Note: nothing marfū’ is authentic about this

Certain scholars did deduce that ‘Āshūrā’ is actually the ninth of Muḥarram and they quoted:

عن الحكم بن الأعرج قال: انتهيت إلى ابن عباس رضي الله عنهما وهو متوسد رداءه في زمزم فقلت له: أخبرني عن صوم عاشوراء؟ فقال: إذا رأيت هلال المحرم فاعدد، وأصبح يوم التاسع صائماً، قلت: هكذا كان رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يصومه قال: نعم [مسلم (١١٣٣)]

al-Ḥakam bin al-A‘raj said: "I came to Ibn ‘Abbās, may Allāh be pleased with both, while he was using his cloak as a pillow at Zamzam, and I said to him: 'Inform me about the

fasting of 'Āshūrā?' He said: 'When you see the crescent of al-Muḥarram, then count, and begin the morning of the ninth day fasting.' I said: 'Is this how the Messenger of Allāh ﷺ used to fast it?' He said: 'Yes.'" [Muslim (1133)]

This has another narration in al-Muntakhab min musnad 'abd bin ḥumayd (672) and Ṣaḥīḥ Ibn Khuzaymah (2098) with Isnād Ṣaḥīḥ. Al-'Aynī said explaining this:

أي: صم التاسع مع العاشر، وأراد بقوله: نعم، ما روي من عزمه، صلى الله عليه وسلم، على صوم التاسع من قوله: لأصومن التاسع [عمدة القارئ ١١٧/١١]

Meaning: Fast the ninth with the tenth, and he intended by his saying, "Yes," what has been narrated of his determination ﷺ to fast the ninth, from his statement: "I will surely fast the ninth." [‘Umdat al-Qārī (11/117)]

al-Qāḍī 'iyād said:

ولعله على طريق الجمع مع العاشر لئلا يتشبه باليهود، كما ورد في رواية أخرى: فصوموا التاسع والعاشر. [إكمال المعلم بفوائد مسلم (٤ / ٨٥)]

And perhaps it is by way of combining with the tenth so as not to resemble the Jews, as has been reported in another narration: "So fast the ninth and the tenth." [Ikmal al-Mu'allim bi Fawā'id Muslim (4/85)]

Also see Sharḥ Ma'ānī al-Āthār 4/329, Sharḥ Ibn Baṭṭāl 4/142 and Tahdhīb al-Lughah 2/47

This brings us to an important principle. It is to understand the narrations in a wholesome manner as they explain one another. What is correct is that it is the tenth.

Ibn Sirīn said it is the tenth day [al-Muṣannaf 9635 with Isnād Ṣaḥīḥ; Hishām bin Hassān from Ibn Sirīn is Ṣaḥīḥ].

This is very important as he is the one who heard the saying of Ibn ‘Abbās and acted upon it (p. 11). Al-Ḍaḥḥāk saying it is the ninth day (al-Muṣannaf 9634; Isnād Ṣaḥīḥ) can either be interpreted to what Ibn ‘Abbās said (previous page) or we say he did his own ijtihād and was mistaken based on evidences and that Tābī‘un are not evidence in and of themselves. See my article “The 4 imams warned against Taqleed” and “The truth is one not multiple.”

Unauthentic actions during this season:

قال ابن تيمية: وقد قتل غير واحد من الأنبياء والصحابة والصالحين مظلوما شهيدا، وليس في دين المسلمين أن يجعلوا يوم قتل أحدهم مأتما، وكذلك اتخاذه عيداً بدعة. وكل ما يروى عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم في يوم عاشوراء غير صومه فهو كذب، مثل ما يروى في الاغتسال يوم عاشوراء، والاكتمال، وصلاة يوم عاشوراء [جامع المسائل (١٥١/٥)]

This Ibn Taymiyyah said: "And more than one of the prophets, the Companions, and the righteous have been killed wrongfully as martyrs, and it is not from the religion of the Muslims to make the day of the killing of any of them a day of mourning, and likewise, taking it as an ‘Īd is an innovation. And everything narrated from the Prophet ﷺ regarding the day of ‘Āshūrā’ other than his fasting is a lie, such as what is narrated regarding taking a bath on the day of ‘Āshūrā’, applying kohl, and the prayer on the day of ‘Āshūrā’." [Jāmi‘ al-Masā’il (5/151)]

قال ابن تيمية: وأما ما يروى في الكحل يوم عاشوراء، أو الخضاب أو الاغتسال، أو المصافحة، أو مسح رأس البيتيم، أو أكل الحبوب، أو الذبح، ونحو ذلك: فكل ذلك كذب على النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم ومثل ذلك بدعة لا يستحب منه شيء عند أئمة الدين، وما يفعله أهل البدع فيه من النباحة والندب والمأتم، وسب الصحابة رضي الله عنهم هو أيضا من أعظم البدع والمنكرات وكل بدعة ضلالة. [الفتاوى الكبرى (٥/ ٤٧٩)]

Ibn Taymiyyah said: "As for what is narrated regarding applying kohl on the day of 'Āshūrā', or dyeing (the hair/beard), taking a bath, shaking hands, wiping the head of an orphan, eating grains, slaughtering, and the like: all of that is a lie upon the Prophet ﷺ, and such is an innovation; nothing of it is recommended according to the Imāms of the religion. And what the people of innovation practice on it, of wailing, lamentation, mourning, and reviling the Companion, may Allah be pleased with them, is also from the greatest of innovations and evils, and every innovation is misguidance." [Al-Fatāwā al-Kubrā (5/479)]

قال ابن القيم: الاحتفال يوم عاشوراء، والتزين، والتوسعة، والصلاة فيه، وغير ذلك من فضائل. لا يصح منها شيء، ولا حديث واحد، ولا يثبت عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم فيه غير أحاديث صيامه. وما عداها فباطل [المنار المنيف ص ١٠٣]

Ibn al-Qayyim said: "Applying kohl on the day of 'Āshūrā', beautifying oneself, spending generously (on the family), prayer on it (specifically), and other than that of virtues; none of it is authentic, not a single Ḥadīth, and nothing is established from the Prophet ﷺ regarding it other than the Ḥadīths of his fasting, and whatever is besides that is falsehood/fabricated." [Al-Manār al-Munīf (p. 103)]

قال ابن رجب: وكل ما روي في فضل الاحتفال في يوم عاشوراء والاختضاب والاعتسال فيه، فموضوع لا يصح. [لطائف المعارف (ص ١١٢)]

Ibn Rajab said: "And everything narrated concerning the virtue of applying kohl on the day of 'Āshūrā', dyeing, and taking a bath on it (specifically) is fabricated, it is not authentic." [Laṭā'if al-Ma'ārif (p. 112)]

As for spending on the family on this day then there is no authentic chain as Ibn Rajab said (Laṭā'if al-Ma'ārif p. 113). Even the chain in al-Istidhkār 3/331 is Ma'lūl as Shu'bah left narrating from Abu al-Zubair at some point. Shaykh Amanpūri, may Allah preserve him, wrote an article analysing all the chains and he came to the same conclusion. Also see al-l'tiṣām with taḥqīq of Shaykh Sa'd al-Ḥumayyid 2/255.

As for claiming that these chains support each other than it is as al-Mu'allimī said:

بل يوهن بعضها بعضاً [تعليقه على الفوائد المجموعة ص ١٠٠]

"Rather, they weaken each other" [His Ta'līq on al-Fawāid al-Majmu'ah p. 100]

There is no doubt that al-Ḥusayn, may Allah be pleased with him was killed unjustly in this month by the same people that claim to love him. But we must act according to evidences, not emotions.

أم سلمة زوج النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم حين جاء نعي الحسين بن علي، لعنت أهل العراق، فقالت: قتلوه، قتلهم الله، غرّوه وذلّوه [مسند أحمد (٢٦٥٥٠) وسنده حسن، رواية عبد الحميد عن شهر جيدة]

When the news of the death of al-Ḥusayn bin 'Alī arrived, Umm Salamah, the wife of the Prophet ﷺ, cursed the people of Iraq, saying: "They killed him, may Allāh kill them; they deceived him and humiliated him." [Musnad Aḥmad (26550); Its Isnād is Ḥasan, the narration of 'Abd al-Ḥamīd from Shahr is authentic]

Ibn 'Umar, may Allah be pleased with both, said:

أهل العراق يسألون عن الذباب، وقد قتلوا ابن ابنة رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم [البخاري (٣٧٥٣)]
"The people of Iraq ask about [killing] flies, while they have indeed killed the son of the daughter of the Messenger of Allāh ﷺ!" [Al-Bukhārī (3753)]

Even the books of the Shī'ah confirm that he was killed by the people of 'Iraq/Kufah. See al-Iḥtijāj 2/29, al-Irshād 2/110-111, Muthīr al-Aḥzān p. 137

Wa Sallallahu Ala Sayyidina Muhammad Wa Ala Alihi Wa Ashabihi Wa-Sallam Tasliman Kathira.



Muzammil al-Balūshī,
Karachi, Pakistan